

19. HOUSEHOLDER APPLICATION - FOR ALTERATIONS AND EXTENSION TO DWELLING AND NEW GARAGE, AT PATHWAYS, YOULGRAVE(NP/DDD/1223/1442, DH)

APPLICANT: MRS H WARDLE

Summary

1. The application is for the erection of a two-storey extension to the property, a new porch, and a detached single garage.
2. The scale of the proposed two storey extension to the dwelling has been reduced considerably from a previous scheme which was refused for the following reasons, “The scale, form, massing and design of the extension is considered to be wholly unacceptable as it fails to respect the simple form and character of the existing dwelling and the area within which it is sited. As a result of its scale the extension would dominate and harm the appearance of to the existing dwelling, the adjoining dwelling, and the wider cul-de-sac. Furthermore, it would be overbearing and have an unacceptable effect on the amenities of the adjoining property.”
3. The revised scheme has addressed the previous concerns with regard to amenity, and is considered to be of a suitable design, scale, form and massing which does not have an adverse effect on the character and appearance of the dwelling or its setting.
4. The application is recommended for approval.

Site and Surroundings

5. Pathways is a semi-detached dormer bungalow standing on the south-west side of a cul-de-sac called Brassington Close which is accessed off the east side of Mawstone Lane in Youlgrave.
6. Although not within the Youlgrave Conservation Area, the site is just 15m from the conservation area boundary.
7. The cul-de-sac occupies a sloping site with large detached single storey dwellings to each side, the exception being this pair of bungalows. The principal elevations of the properties face south and due to the slope of the land look over the roofs of the property below. This pair and some of the properties to the opposite side of the cul-de-sac are dormer bungalows. None of the properties are traditional in terms of their design and materials used for their construction.
8. Pathways and its adjoining neighbour, are constructed from artificial stone and the rear elevations are rendered. The roof is clad with Hardrow tile and the flat roofed box dormer to the principal elevations has a timber clad appearance. The doors and windows are upvc, as are the rainwater goods. A flat roofed off-shot to the rear is a mix of stone and render with a felted roof sitting just under the eaves, as shown on the original plans; the adjoining property has raised the height of this element by approximately three courses of stonework so that the flat roof sits above the eaves. The pair are otherwise identical. A small paved terrace runs along the frontage of the pair of dwellings with the sloping garden beyond, to the rear, a paved area with a low retaining wall leads onto the rest of the garden to the north-west.
9. The nearest neighbouring property is Shillong, attached to the west, Greywalls to the south at a distance of 13m, and Afe-way, a recently re-modelled and extended detached former bungalow, stands on the opposite side of the road.

Proposal

10. The proposal is for the erection of a detached single garage to the rear of the dwelling, and extensions and alterations to the dwelling, namely, a porch off the side elevation and a two-storey extension to the rear, with alterations to the first floor.

RECOMMENDATION:

- **That the application be APPROVED subject to the following conditions:**
- **Statutory time limit**
- **The development to be in accordance with the submitted plans drawing numbers 2231-500, Revision A (block plan), 2231-10 (proposed plans, elevations and sections for the works to the dwelling), and 2231-11 (proposed plans and elevations for the garage), received by the Authority 5 December 2023**
- **New doors and windows shall be recessed to the same depth as the existing**
- **Roof verges shall be flush mortar pointed with no projecting rafters or barge boards**
- **Rooflights shall be fitted flush with the roofslope**
- **Rainwater goods shall be black and on brackets**
- **The submitted climate change mitigation measures shall be fully implemented before the development is brought into use and then shall be maintained for the lifetime of the development.**

Key Issues

11. The key issues are:

- Whether the proposed development is of a suitable design, scale, form and massing which does not have an adverse effect on the character and appearance of the dwelling or its setting; and
- Whether the proposals raise any amenity issues upon the dwelling itself, any neighbouring properties, or the wider area within which it sits.

History

12. 1959 – An outline permission for the land to be developed as housing was granted by NP/BAR/759/131
13. 1961 - Planning permission for the erection of a pair of semi-detached bungalows was granted under NP/BAR/461/19
14. 2023 – Application NP/DDD/0723/0807, for a two-storey rear extension, porch and garage was refused.

Consultations

15. Derbyshire County Council (Highway Authority) – No objection as Brassington Close is a private road.
16. Derbyshire Dales District Council – No response to date.
17. Youlgrave Parish Council – Objection. The PC states the following reasons:
- Overbearing
 - Creates a disproportionate look to half of a semi-detached bungalow
 - The garage appears to create a difficult access for the neighbouring property

- and may even over the existing right of access
- Visible location where large alterations to properties are changing the character of the village
- A modern townscape is being introduced on the hillside in front of the conservation area and church tower

Officer comment: The PC did not respond to the consultation request regarding the previous application, which was refused. This resubmission has been discussed prior to submission and further amendments were requested which have reduced the scale considerably to address the concerns of the Authority.

Representations

18. During the publicity period the Authority has not received any formal representations regarding the proposal.

Main Policies

19. Relevant Core Strategy policies: GSP1, GSP2, GSP3, CC1, DS1 & L1
20. Relevant Local Plan policies: DMC3, DMH7 & DMH8
21. National Planning Policy Framework

Wider Policy Context

22. National Park designation is the highest level of landscape designation in the UK. The Environment Act 1995 sets out two statutory purposes for national parks in England and Wales:
 - Conserve and enhance the natural beauty, wildlife and cultural heritage
 - Promote opportunities for the understanding and enjoyment of the special qualities of national parks by the public
 - When national parks carry out these purposes they also have the duty to:
 - Seek to foster the economic and social well-being of local communities within the national parks.

National Planning Policy Framework

23. The National Planning Policy Framework (NPPF) replaced a significant proportion of central government planning policy with immediate effect. A revised NPPF was published in December 2023. The Government's intention is that the document should be considered as a material consideration and carry particular weight where a development plan is absent, silent or relevant policies are out of date. In the National Park the development plan comprises the Authority's Core Strategy 2011 and policies in the Peak District National Park Development Management Policies document 2019. Policies in the Development Plan provide a clear starting point consistent with the National Park's statutory purposes for the determination of this application. It is considered that in this case there is no significant conflict between prevailing policies in the Development Plan and more recent Government guidance in the NPPF.
24. Paragraph 182 of the NPPF states that '*great weight should be given to conserving and enhancing landscape and scenic beauty in National Parks, the Broads and Areas of Outstanding Natural Beauty, which have the highest status of protection in relation to these issues. The conservation and enhancement of wildlife and cultural heritage are also important considerations in all these areas, and should be given great weight in National Parks and the Broads.*'

Peak District National Park Core Strategy

25. GSP1 & GSP2 - *Securing National Park Purposes and sustainable development & Enhancing the National Park*. These policies set out the broad strategy for achieving the National Park's objectives, and jointly seek to secure national park legal purposes and duties through the conversion and enhancement of the National Park's landscape and its natural and heritage
26. GSP3 - *Development Management Principles*. GSP3 states that all development must respect, conserve and enhance all valued characteristics of the site and buildings, paying particular attention to, amongst other elements, impact on the character and setting of buildings, scale of the development appropriate to the character and appearance of the National Park, design in accordance with the National Park Authority Design Guide and impact on living conditions of communities.
27. CC1 – *Climate change mitigation and adaptation*. CC1 requires all development to make the most efficient and sustainable use of land, buildings and natural resources to achieve the highest possible standards of carbon reductions.
28. DS1 - *Development Strategy*. This sets out what forms of development are acceptable in principle within the National Park.
29. L1 - *Landscape character and valued characteristics*. L1 states that all development must conserve and enhance valued landscape character and valued characteristics, and other than in exceptional circumstances, proposals in the Natural Zone will not be permitted.

Local Plan Development Management Policies

30. DMC3 - *Siting, design, layout and landscaping*. DMC3 states that where development is acceptable in principle, it will be permitted provided that its detailed treatment is of a high standard that respects, protects and where possible enhances the natural beauty, quality and visual amenity of the landscape, including the wildlife and cultural heritage that contribute to the distinctive sense of place.
31. DMH7 – *Extensions and alterations* - Policy DMH7 states that these will be permitted provided that the proposal does not: (i) detract from the character, appearance or amenity of the original building, its setting, or neighbouring building; or (ii) dominate the dwelling; or (iii) amount to the creation of a separate independent dwelling; or (iv) create an adverse effect on, or lead to undesirable changes to, the landscape or any other valued characteristic.
32. DMH8 – *New outbuildings and alterations and extensions to existing outbuildings in the curtilage of dwelling houses* – DMH8 (A) states that new outbuildings will be permitted provided the scale, mass, form and design of the new building conserves or enhances the immediate dwelling and curtilage, any valued characteristics of the adjacent built environment and/or the landscape.

Supplementary Planning Documents

33. The Authority has adopted three separate supplementary planning documents (SPD) that offers design guidance on householder development namely the Design Guide, the Building Design Guide and the Detailed Design Guide on Alterations and Extensions.

34.

Assessment

Principle of the development

34. Core Strategy policy DS1 states that, in principle, extensions and alterations to dwellings, including new outbuildings within their curtilage, are supported by the Authority provided that they are of a high standard of design, scale, form and massing and do not raise any amenity issues upon the dwelling itself or any neighbouring properties.

Visual Impacts

35. The proposed alterations, and in particular the two-storey extension of the dwelling, have been extensively discussed since the previous application was refused. This resubmission has revised the internal floorplan to facilitate a substantially reduced two-storey rear extension orientated at right angles to the existing ridge line, the porch and garage remain as previously proposed.
36. The proposed single garage is at the rear of the dwelling, with its ridge oriented the same way as the existing dwelling. It has a simple rectangular footprint of 4m by 6.7m, and a pitch roof with an eaves level of 2.5m, and a ridge height of 3.1m. The only opening is the garage door, which is metal, in other regards, the materials match those of the dwelling it would serve. This aspect of the proposals is in line with the Authority's guidance for ancillary domestic buildings and policies GSP3, DMC3 and DMH8.
37. The single storey gabled porch is off the north-east gable and set well back from the wall plane of the principal elevation. The massing echoes that of the bungalow, having a pitched roof with over-sailing eaves and the ridge of the roof follows that of the main dwelling. It would be constructed from matching materials. As such, the porch is in line with guidance in the Authority's adopted SPD on extensions and alterations, and complaint with policies GSP3, DMC3 and DMH7.
38. The plans for the two-storey rear extension now provide a degree of articulation from the existing ridge height and gable of the dwelling, and more articulation from the neighbouring, adjoined, property. In addition, the depth the extension protrudes from the rear wall has been reduced considerably so that it does not breach the 45 degree rule as previously. The frontage matches the existing in terms of the box dormer; the new opening below, in the original wall of the dwelling, is the same width. It was suggested that these openings be reduced in width to three lights, however, it was confirmed that the applicant wanted the resubmission determined on the basis of the submitted plans. In view of the existing box dormer which spans both properties being very wide, the proposed is not so incongruous that it would warrant refusal on this detail. The materials for the construction would match the construction materials of the dwelling. As now proposed, the rear extension is considered to be in line with policies and the guidance in the Authority's SPD.
39. The proposed scheme does not detract from the character or appearance of the dwelling or its setting. It is therefore considered that the proposals are compliant with the requirements of the Authority's SPD on extensions and alterations, and with policies GSP3, L1, DMC3 and DMH7.

Amenity Impacts

40. The only openings to the elevation of the rear extension which faces the adjoined property are two small rooflights. Therefore, the proposed does not give rise to overlooking and privacy issues. In addition, as reduced in scale, although it would alter the access along the rear of the bungalows to the adjoining property, it would not block it entirely.
41. Due to the location and nature of the proposed development there would not be any adverse impact on the amenities of neighbouring properties. Nor would there be a detrimental effect on the character and appearance of the host property or its wider setting, which, as noted, is a development of relatively modern housing with little cohesion in terms of design.
42. In terms of amenity issues the proposals are therefore considered to comply with the requirements of GSP3, L1, L3, DMC3, DMC5, DMC7, DMC8 and DMH7 and national planning policy.

Sustainability

43. A statement regarding environmental issues was provided with the application within the Design and Access Statement. It is considered that the proposal complies with the requirements of CC1.

Conclusion

44. The resubmission has reduced the scale of the proposals considerably.
45. The proposed development is not considered to have a detrimental effect on the character and appearance of the existing dwelling, or its setting; nor will the development result in an unacceptable impact on the amenities of the locality or the quiet enjoyment of the nearest neighbouring properties.
46. As such, it is concluded that the proposals are compliant with policies GSP1, 2 & 3, DS1, L1, DMC3, DMH7, DMH8 and national planning policy.

Human Rights

Any human rights issues have been considered and addressed in the preparation of this report.

List of Background Papers (not previously published)

Nil

Report Author and Job Title

Denise Hunt – Planner – South Area